



ESA/STAT/AC.335/15
31 March 2017

UNITED NATIONS
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL AFFAIRS
STATISTICS DIVISION

**Meeting of the Technical Subgroup for the
Classification of Individual Consumption According to Purpose
New York, 4-6 April 2017**

Division 10 EDUCATION

TSG-COICOP

PLEASE NOTE:

This document lists the comments provided by countries and international organisations during the second global consultation.

The document was compiled by the chair of TSG COICOP Ana Franco.

In addition the document contains comments received by the members of TSG COICOP responding to the comments received during the global consultation. Where this is the case the name and organisation / country of the TSG COICOP member is indicated.

Division 10

1. Comments received

- 70.6 % agree or strongly agree in general with the proposed new structure for this division and 67.6% consider this proposal to have the correct level of detail

- Areas where the classification is considered too detailed or without the appropriate detail:
 - o 10.1.0 and 10.5.0. too detailed (Finland, United Kingdom)
 - o Private households very often can't differentiate between the ISCED-Levels of education. Country-specific examples are needed, but not easy to find or not understandable for the households as well. (Germany)

- The following goods or services within this division were proposed to be moved to a different division:
 - o Move excursions from division 10 to division 9 (Croatia)

- Some products or services were mentioned as missing in this division. In most of the cases it is only not clear where they should be classified and they just should be included in the list of examples. The following products or services were mentioned:
 - o Lodging and boarding fees (Kenya)
 - o Languages courses in form of software or audio tapes (09.6.1.1 Educational or text books) (Australia)
 - o Move textbooks from Division 09 to Division10 (Poland, Singapore)
 - o Language courses (not immersion) for young, teen and adults (Brazil);
 - o Information technology issues, when people learn how to use a specific software (Brazil)
 - o Courses developed for specific purposes like bar exam; entrance examination; government jobs (Brazil)
 - o Tuition fees (UNESCO)
 - o Parent association fees, (UNESCO)
 - o Admission and registration fees, (UNESCO)
 - o Contribution for construction/maintenance of school facilities, (UNESCO)
 - o Gifts/unofficial payments (UNESCO)
 - o E-learning services (Germany)

- The terminology used is in general considered understandable by the average household by 97.8 % of the countries. The following terms were considered needing clarifications:
 - o 10.5.0.1 "Tutoring": Does it includes private lessons to support formal education? (Spain)
 - o It would be useful to explain better the difference between 10.3.0.0 and 10.5.0.2 (Bolivia)

- Other relevant comments were:

- Early childhood education (at 10.1.0.1) can overlap with child care services(13.3.0.1) (Israel)
- Since this function only covers educational services, it should be renamed Educational services. BTW, since COICOP is a functional classification, all expenditures directly related to education (books, transport services, canteen...) should be included (but they are excluded as well in the current COICOP). (World Bank)
- Adopting International Standard Classification of Education (ISCED), Division 10 only captures educational services. Meanwhile to portrait educational expense as a whole, all expense related to education should be classified in the same division. We propose to move "educational or text book" and part of "stationary and drawing materials" into Division 10. So the structure of Division 10 will be : education services (adopt from ISCED) + education equipment and peripheral (from Division 9). (Indonesia)
- 10.4.0.0 Tertiary education includes on-line tertiary education as it is large education medium (Australia)
- 10.5.0 - Education not defined by level - languages courses on line, in form of software or audio tapes should exclude languages courses in form of software or audio tapes (09.6.1.1 Educational or text books) (Australia)
- Where should language learning books sold together with a CD be classified? Do they fit in Division 09 or rather in Division10? (Poland)
- Does grouping 10.5.0.1 include all tutoring even when it is connected with e.g. high school education? The alternative would be to include school-related tutoring in 10.2.0.0 (Poland)
- To rename 10.5 as Tutoring and other services (Singapore)
- The classification of special education services for individuals (children and adults) with learning difficulties, physical disabilities and/or communication and behavioural challenges (e.g. down syndrome, autism) needs to be better addressed in the revised COICOP. It is presently not clear where these should be classified. (Singapore)
- In 10.5.0.2 replace "...international travels for learning languages" by "...international travels with educational purposes (eg: languages" (Portugal)
- It could be included all types of non-formal and informal education in subclass 10.5.0. For example, 09.5.4.9 Other cultural services. (Chile)
- How to classify Inscription fees that include books (Costa Rica)
- In the introduction of division 10 it is said that transport and accommodation services are excluded but it should be added except in the case of excursions which are part of the normal school programme (Eurostat)
- Tutoring should also be mentioned in class 10.5.0 (Eurostat)
- The draft must define the order of the subclasses 10.5.0.1 and 10.5.0.2, since are presented in two different ways (in the main changes proposed and in the structure). (Chile)
- Add online/correspondence options to all classes (New Zealand)
- Does 10.5.0.1 Tutoring includes music tutoring (ie piano lessons?). (New Zealand)

2 - Issues not needing discussion

1 – Private households very often can't differentiate between the ISCED-Levels of education. Country-specific examples are needed, but not easy to find or not understandable for the households as well.

Ana, Eurostat: The questionnaires for the household budget survey should use the terminology relative to the national education system. The classes proposed are however very broad and I think that in general people are able to distinguish, primary, Secondary or tertiary level of education.

Andrew, NZ: Think it advisable that countries use the terminology of their national education system and then map to ISCED. Also ISCED focusses a lot on completion or partial completion which makes the direct mapping a bit difficult. Also within regions there are similar labels used with different inputs/definitions so it hard for an international standard, and COICOP, to cover those distinctions.

Aimee, IMF: Agree. Should be adapted to the national education system

Alexander, UNSD: The NSOs can guidance in the national household surveys.

Alice, STATCAN: agreed. For international reporting, NSOs map to the ISCED terminology

2 – Include language courses (not immersion) for young, teen and adults

Ana, Eurostat: They should be included in 10.5.0 - Education not defined by level. They will be explicitly mentioned.

Andrew, NZ: So it is assumed that immersion courses that are part of the educational curriculum are identifiable in 101,102,103 etc. Immersion in Maro language may occur in a school, as well as in a Kohanga Reo placed at marae or other palce.

Alexander, UNSD: Ok

Alice, STATCAN: agreed

3 – Include Information technology issues, when people learn how to use a specific software

Ana, Eurostat: They should be included in 10.5.0 - Education not defined by level. They will be explicitly mentioned.

Alexander, UNSD: Or could that be in 09.4.6.1 Recreational and leisure services ☐ out-of-school individual or group lessons in bridge, chess etc.; We would then need to mention “computer courses that are not part of formal education” or something similar. We should only have here more or less formal education. Another solution is to move all non-formal education to Division 10. ISIC also has all recreational courses in Division 85 together with primary, secondary and tertiary education. Furthermore, we have already part of the non-formal education in Division 10 (tutoring, cultural development).

Alice, STATCAN: we need to discuss. In my opinion, all should be in 10.5.0.2. But what do we include?

Games, computing and other hobby instructional programs
Sport, exercise and nature appreciation instructional programs (skating, dancing, hockey)
Home and domestic skills instructional programs (cooking, gardening)
Exclude driving lessons

4 - Courses developed for specific purposes like bar exam; entrance examination; government jobs

Ana, Eurostat: They should be included in 10.5.0 - Education not defined by level. They will be explicitly mentioned.

Alexander, UNSD: Or are course preparing for bar exams that are part of formal education part of tertiary education? Maybe we can ask UNESCO.

Alice, STATCAN: Agreed. Suggest broadening 10.5.01 to :

- Exam preparation courses and tutoring services

5 – Where to classify Admission and registration fees

Ana, Eurostat: I think that this exactly what is collected in this Division. This should be clarified in the explanatory notes.

6 – Include E-learning services

Ana, Eurostat: This is already mentioned in the beginning of the division. It could be repeated mainly for the tertiary education.

7 - It would be useful to explain better the difference between 10.3.0.0 and 10.5.0.2

Ana, Eurostat: We should ask UNESCO colleagues to provide better explanatory notes.

8 –10.5.0.1 "Tutoring": Does it includes private lessons to support formal education?

Ana, Eurostat: Yes, this could be explicitly mentioned in the notes.

9 - Early childhood education (at 10.1.0.1) can overlap with child care services(13.3.0.1)

Ana, Eurostat: The difference has to be clarified in the notes. The educational component makes the difference. Child care with educational program are to be classified in Division 10.

Andrew, NZ: Need to be very careful on the distinction.

10 –10.5.0 - Education not defined by level - languages courses on line, in form of software or audio tapes should exclude languages courses in form of software or audio tapes (09.6.1.1 Educational or text books)

Ana, Eurostat: Ok

Aimee, IMF: The demarcation should be made clear.

I think that Class 10.5.0 covers the service (for example an educational course in the form of a software or audio tapes), and that Sub-class 09.6.1.1 covers the Educational or text books that can be in an electronic form, etc.

09.6.1.1 Educational or text books reads as follows:

Includes:

- formal education text books (school/academic manuals etc)
- educational e-books
- pre-recorded tapes and CDs, DVDs, Blu-ray, flash-drives of educational books.
- download of educational books
- removable media containing books, dictionaries, encyclopaedias, foreign language trainers, in the form of software

Includes also all electronic forms of educational books (e-books and audio-books)

What is foreign language trainers?

11 - To rename 10.5 as Tutoring and other services

Ana, Eurostat: Don't see the need of changing the name. The sub-class covers only tutoring services.

12 - In 10.5.0.2 replace "...international travels for learning languages" by "...international travels with educational purposes (eg: languages)

Ana, Eurostat: Ok.

Alexander, UNSD: Ok

Alice, STATCAN: see my comments in 4.

13 - In the introduction of division 10 it is said that transport and accommodation services are excluded but it should be added except in the case of excursions which are part of the normal school programme

Ana, Eurostat: This inconsistency has to be solved when deciding what goes into Division 10 or not.

Aimee, IMF: Need to discuss further. I tend to agree that Division 10 should cover only the educational services; then the classification of excursions as part of educational programs should be reviewed.

14 - Tutoring should also be mentioned in class 10.5.0

Ana, Eurostat: Ok

15 - Add online/correspondence options to all classes

Ana, Eurostat: Ok

3 - Issues needing discussion

1 – Move excursions from division 10 to division 9

Ana, Eurostat: We will need to take a consistent approach to all expenses that overlap with education (excursions, school transport, school uniforms, school books, food and accommodation). Either we include them all in Division 10 or we maintain them on the thematic divisions but with separate classes/sub-classes in order that the total education expenditures can be recalculated.

Andrew, NZ: So if in lieu of fees, a parent is required to pay a donation (which is tax deductible) to the school to cover incidentals such as school trips, but then may have to pay for a particular educational event such as a bus trip to a museum, or fee to have swimming at a municipal pool, you would class this all as education?

Alexander, UNSD: At my son's school. Most of the excursions and multiple-day-trips that are part of the regular educational programme are bundled together with the normal tuition and are not charged separately. It makes sense to keep them in Division 10, as we also leave travel for language purposes in Division 10. Anything else would be inconsistent. In that sense the excursions are different from things like uniforms, school transportation, etc.

2 – Include Lodging and boarding fees/ Move textbooks from Division 09 to Division10/Include languages courses in form of software or audio tapes

Ana, Eurostat: See previous

Alexander, UNSD: I tend to like the idea to include languages courses in form of software or audio tapes.

3 – Where to classify Tuition fees, Parent association fees, Contribution for construction/maintenance of school facilities

Ana, Eurostat: I don't think that these different payments can be classified in the present COICOP... shall we have a class for them?

Andrew, NZ: Does depend if the fee is seen treated as a donation (as in the case for state schools in NZ) compared to fees for private schools which are all encompassing payments. Tuition fees payable to a piano teacher for lessons during school time, but the teacher isn't an employee of the school – what then? Also payments for construction are usually as a result of fundraising as the ministry of education would fund repairs. So not entirely sure there is a need to have a separate class

Alexander, UNSD: All these expenditure should be classified in the corresponding class, e.g. tuition fees, PA fees, capital surcharges for e.g. primary school should all be classified in 10.1.0.2 Primary education. If these expenditures were to be classified somewhere else, what would go in 10.1.0.2?

Alana, NZ: May need a class for these fees. Was thinking along the lines of school fees. You are paying for the education service. The fees are associated to education, but not sure if they should go to Div10 or Div12?

4 – Where to classify Gifts/unofficial payments?

Ana, Eurostat: Is this under the scope of COICOP?

Andrew, NZ: So if a gift is given as payment for an after dinner speec for example where does that go?

Alexander, UNSD: Under bribes? ;-) We might need a general note on these in the introduction, similar to tips.

Alana, NZ: I was wondering if in scope or not too? Some donations are tax deductible in NZ (school donations and donations made to registered charities). Are you consuming a product or service?...in the case of the school donations these are not compulsory fees, but they are charged to help recover some of the cost of activities the children do at school. So they are paying for something that has been consumed. With church donations – you are donating towards the upkeep of the church (consuming the church services). I am not sure if this holds for all donations though? I did spot that ‘charitable donations are excluded from COICOP (& CPI). I can see why they are not in CPI, but not sure about COICOP? In some cases donations could be a large expenditure item.

5 – Rename the division Education services.

Ana, Eurostat: If we go for the option of having only education services it would be useful to change the name.

6 – Where should language learning books sold together with a CD be classified? Do they fit in Division 09 or rather in Division10?

Ana, Eurostat: It depends on the decision taken on point 1 for discussion.

7 –Does grouping 10.5.0.1 include all tutoring even when it is connected with e.g. high school education? The alternative would be to include school-related tutoring in 10.2.0.0

Ana, Eurostat: I don't understand the question. I think that tutoring has different meanings according to the country. By tutoring we meant an instructor who gives private lessons. In this Wikipedia article shows that different interpretations of tutoring exist around World.
<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Tutor> We should also mention in the notes the on-line tutoring.

Andrew, NZ: So we can be clear about a tutor (who tutors at a university and/or polytechnic/vocational education institution; a tutor who works in school time (either secondary or primary) to assist pupils, compared to an out of school tutor tutoring in maths or physics.

Alexander, UNSD: I understand under tutoring additional classes that are given to support the student to keep with the formal classes or to improve the student's / pupil's performance. In that sense they are not part of the formal education and should therefore not be classified together with the expenditure of let's say primary education, as they not necessary to follow the formal courses.

8 –The classification of special education services for individuals (children and adults) with learning difficulties, physical disabilities and/or communication and behavioural challenges (e.g. down syndrome, autism) needs to be better addressed in the revised COICOP. It is presently not clear where these should be classified.

Ana, Eurostat: Special education services for individuals (children and adults) with learning difficulties, physical disabilities and/or communication and behavioural challenges (e.g. down syndrome, autism) are now coded in 13.3.0.9 Other social protection services. I'm not sure that this is ideal. Perhaps it would be more reasonable to have a specific class in Division 10.

Andrew, NZ: Do we need a class for indigenous specific education needs eg indigenous crafts, language etc?

Alexander, UNSD: I think the scope of 13.3.0.9 Other social protection services ☐ schools for disabled persons where the main aim is to help students overcome their disability is probably different than of the education in Division 10. If we put all education Division 10, then also the schools for disabled persons should be in Division 10. IMHO they should be classified in the same categories as the schools for individuals that have no special needs.

Furthermore, ISCED 2011 defines formal education as follows and includes them in formal education:

- o Formal education: Education that is institutionalised, intentional and planned through public organizations and recognised private bodies and – in their totality – constitute the formal education system of a country. Formal education programmes are thus recognised as such by the relevant national education authorities or equivalent authorities, e.g. any other institution in cooperation with the national or sub-national education authorities. Formal education consists mostly of initial education. Vocational education, special needs education and some parts of adult education are often recognised as being part of the formal education system.

- o Special needs education: Education designed to facilitate learning by individuals who, for a wide variety of reasons, require additional support and adaptive pedagogical methods in order to participate and meet learning objectives in an education programme. Reasons may include (but are not limited to) disadvantages in physical, behavioural, intellectual, emotional and social capacities. Education programmes in special needs education may follow a similar curriculum as that offered in the parallel regular education system, but they take individual needs into account by providing specific resources (e.g. specially-trained personnel, equipment or space) and, if appropriate, modified educational content or learning objectives. These programmes can be offered to individual students within already-existing education programmes or as a separate class in the same or separate educational institutions.

Finally, the ISCED levels 0 to 3 include education for individuals with special needs:

- o ISCED level 0 includes programmes for children with special needs corresponding to the criteria described in Paragraph 104, irrespective of their ages.
- o ISCED level 1 includes programmes suited to individuals with special needs if the programme provides systematic teaching and learning in the fundamental skills of reading, writing and mathematics, irrespective of the age of the participant.
- o ISCED level 2 includes programmes suited to individuals with special needs that are designed to build on the fundamental teaching and learning processes that begin at ISCED level 1 and/or to provide skills relevant to employment.

o ISCED level 3 includes programmes suited to individuals with special needs that are equivalent in complexity of content to programmes already classified at ISCED level 3.

AIAna, Eurostat: If educational services – why not included in Div 10? Is it due to education not being the primary activity of an institution?

9 – It could be included all types of non-formal and informal education in subclass 10.5.0. For example, 09.5.4.9 Other cultural services.

Ana, Eurostat: No, the services proposed in 09.5.4.9 have nothing to do with education

Alexander, UNSD: I tend to agree with the proposal. ISIC also has everything in the same Division. Maybe we need to consult our UNESCO colleagues again.

10 – How to classify Inscription fees that include books

Ana, Eurostat: Some guidance should be given on these cases. I think that they have to be included.

Alexander, UNSD: It is a bundle. If the books are not separately charged they are part of the tuition / inscription fee. We need to clarify this.

11 – Does 10.5.0.1 Tutoring includes music tutoring (ie piano lessons?).

Ana, Eurostat: The word tutoring is generating a lot of confusion. Perhaps we should find another term that describes better the content of the sub-class or just define it in a clearer way.

Andrew, NZ: Need to think perhaps around the occupational or industrial definitions as well but it definitely needs a good contextual distinction.

10 EDUCATION

This division covers educational services only. It includes education by radio or television broadcasting as well as eLearning.

The breakdown of educational services is based upon the level categories of the 2011 revision of the International Standard Classification of Education (ISCED 2011) of the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO).

This division does not include expenditures on educational materials, such as:

- education support services, such as health-care services (06)
- transport services (07.3)
- books (09.6.1)
- stationery (09.6.4)
- catering services (11.1.2)
- accommodation services (11.2.0)

10.1 - Early childhood and primary education

10.1.0 - Early childhood and primary education

Includes:

- levels 0 and 1 of ISCED 2011 Early childhood and primary education.
- literacy programmes for students too old for primary school.
- excursions which are part of the normal school programme (travel and accommodation costs)

10.1.0.1 Early childhood education

Includes:

- ISCED 2011 level 0: Early childhood education is designed primarily to support children's early cognitive, physical, social and emotional development and introduce very young children to organised instruction outside of the family context. Programmes are designed for children below the entry age to primary education and are typically centre or school-based.

This education may also be provided in hospitals or in special schools or training centres.

- excursions which are part of the normal school programme (travel and accommodation costs)

10.1.0.2 Primary education

Includes:

- ISCED 2011 level 1: Primary education usually begins at age 5, 6 or 7 and generally lasts for 4 to 7 years. Programmes are normally designed to provide students with fundamental skills in reading, writing and mathematics and establish a solid foundation for learning and understanding core areas of knowledge and personal and social development. Organised instruction for children with special needs should also be included and literacy or basic skills programmes within or outside the school system which are similar in content to programme in primary education.
- literacy programmes for students too old for primary school.
- excursions which are part of the normal school programme (travel and accommodation costs)

10.2 - Secondary education

10.2.0 - Secondary education

Includes:

- levels 2 and 3 of ISCED 2011: lower-secondary and upper-secondary education. Secondary education is designed to lay the foundation for lifelong learning and human development and to provide the skills and knowledge needed either for further studies at post-secondary and tertiary levels or for entry to the labour market, or both. Programmes are increasingly subject oriented and specialised. Different study options or streams are offered, including vocational education and training. Organised instruction for young people with special needs is also covered.

- secondary education for adults and young people including second chance or reintegration programmes.
- out-of-school secondary education for adults and young people.
- excursions or student exchanges which are part of the normal school programme (travel and accommodation costs)

10.2.0.0 Secondary education

Includes:

- ISCED 2011 levels 2 and 3: lower-secondary and upper-secondary education.

Also includes:

- out-of-school secondary education for adults and young people
- excursions or student exchanges which are part of the normal school programme (travel and accommodation costs)

10.3 - Post-secondary non-tertiary education

10.3.0 - Post-secondary non-tertiary education

Includes:

- level 4 of ISCED 2011: Post-secondary non-tertiary education provides learning experiences building on secondary education, preparing for labour market entry as well as tertiary education. It aims at the individual acquisition of knowledge, skills and competencies lower than the level of complexity characteristic of tertiary education. Post-secondary non-tertiary education is typically designed to provide individuals who completed upper secondary education with non-tertiary qualifications required for progression to tertiary education or for employment when their secondary qualification does not grant such access. For example, graduates from general secondary programmes may choose to complete a non-tertiary vocational qualification; or graduates from vocational secondary programmes may choose to increase their level of qualifications or specialise further.
- out-of-school post-secondary non-tertiary education for adults and young people.
- excursions or student exchanges which are part of the normal school programme (travel and accommodation costs)

10.3.0.0 Post-secondary non-tertiary education

Includes:

- level 4 of ISCED 2011: Post-secondary non-tertiary education provides learning experiences building on secondary education, preparing for labour market entry as well as tertiary education. It aims at the individual acquisition of knowledge, skills and competencies lower than the level of complexity characteristic of tertiary education. Post-secondary non-tertiary education is typically designed to provide individuals who completed upper secondary education with non-tertiary qualifications required for progression to tertiary education or for employment when their secondary qualification does not grant such access. For example, graduates from general secondary programmes may choose to complete a non-tertiary vocational qualification; or graduates from vocational secondary programmes may choose to increase their level of qualifications or specialise further.
- out-of-school post-secondary non-tertiary education for adults and young people.
- excursions or student exchanges which are part of the normal school programme (travel and accommodation costs)

10.4 - Tertiary education

10.4.0 - Tertiary education

Includes:

- levels 5, 6, 7 and 8 of ISCED 2011: tertiary education builds on secondary education and provides learning activities in specialised fields of education. It aims at a high level of complexity and specialisation. It includes both academic education and advanced vocational or professional education. At the highest levels, programmes lead to an advanced research qualification based on advanced study and original research.

- excursions or student exchanges which are part of the normal school programme (travel and accommodation costs)

10.4.0.0 Tertiary education

Includes:

- levels 5, 6, 7 and 8 of ISCED 2011: tertiary education builds on secondary education and provides learning activities in specialised fields of education. It aims at a high level of complexity and specialisation. It includes both academic education and advanced vocational or professional education. At the highest levels, programmes lead to an advanced research qualification based on advanced study and original research.

- excursions or student exchanges which are part of the normal school programme (travel and accommodation costs)

10.5 - Education not defined by level

10.5.0 - Education not defined by level

- educational programmes, generally for adults, which do not require any special prior instruction, in particular vocational training and cultural development.

- language immersion courses and international travels for learning languages

- languages courses on line, in form of software or audio tapes.

Excludes: driving lessons (07.2.4); recreational training courses such as sport or bridge lessons given by independent teachers (09.4.6).

10.5.0.1 Tutoring

Includes:

- independent tutors (private lessons), tutors centres, homework help centres and the like.

10.5.0.2 Other education not defined by level

- educational programmes, generally for adults, which do not require any special prior instruction, in particular vocational training or cultural development.

-language immersion courses and international travels for learning languages

Excludes: driving lessons (07.2.4.3); recreational training courses such as sport or bridge lessons given by independent teachers (09.4.6.1).